

OFFICIAL PROCEEDINGS  
OF THE  
**Board of Commissioners**  
OF SAGINAW COUNTY, MICHIGAN



**SPECIAL SESSION**  
**December 10, 2024**

A Special Session of the Board of Commissioners of Saginaw County, Michigan, held Tuesday, December 10, 2024 at 5:00 p.m. with the Honorable Christopher S. Boyd in the Chair. This meeting was held at the Saginaw County Governmental Center, 111 S. Michigan Ave., Saginaw, Michigan to consider the December 10, 2024 Special Session Agenda. Board Coordinator/Deputy Clerk Suzy Koepplinger took roll, quorum present as follows:

**PRESENT:** Christopher S. Boyd, Jack B. Tany, Lisa R. Coney, Denny M. Harris, Dennis H. Krafft, Gerald D. Little, Sheldon Matthews, Mark S. Piotrowski, Tracey L. Slodowski, Richard A. Spitzer, Michael A. Webster – **11**

**ABSENT:** *None*

**TOTAL:** - **11**

**OTHERS:** Mary Catherine Hannah, Dave Gilbert, Jennifer Broadfoot, Katharine Tessin, Connie Reppuhn, Kitty Packard, Angie Miller, Nicole Lee, Anna McGrath, Bill Stanuszek, Terry Pruitt, Dennis Krajniak, Lori Patterson, Eric Kowalewski, Marlana Cork, Dr. Barbara Jones, Kelly Suppes, Tony DePelsMaeker, Mary McLaughlin, Rhonda Farrell-Butler, Candis Thomas, Jaime Ceja, Alethea Taylor, Lisa Ingram, Amy Schnople, William Crane, Connie Weil, Geoffrey Weil, Judi Lincoln, Rayvin Bleu, Fred Perez, Brandell Adams, Mark Rundell, Stephanie Rundel, Jeff Patterson, Pete Ryan, Amaya Bradley, Shalana Bradley, Sheronda Hodggers, Kelsey Adkins, Brian Rombalski, Ceylon Williams-Bettis, Janet Deneen, Mary McDonald, Jeffrey Patterson, Dawn Granberry, Dr. Christina L. Dillard, Walter Ribble, Tanya Harris, Kareem Bowen, Ginny Boyd, Suzy Koepplinger, Renee Sharkey, Catherine Hicks and others

- ✚ Chairman Boyd announced the rules and procedures that will be followed during this Special Board Session, including adherence to Robert’s Rules of Order and that all comments be addressed to the Chair.
- ✚ Commissioner Little gave the invocation and led the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- ✓ *The Minutes of the November Board Session will be submitted for approval at the December 17, 2024 Board Session.*



## PETITION

November 27, 2024

Vanessa Guerra  
Saginaw County Clerk  
111 S. Michigan Avenue  
Saginaw, MI 48602

**December 10, 2024**  
**Special Session**

Dear Clerk Guerra:

Pursuant to Article II, Section 2.8 of the 2024 Rules of the Saginaw County Board of Commissioners (MCL 46.10), the undersigned members of the Board respectfully petition that a Special Meeting of the Board of Commissioners be held **Tuesday, December 10, 2024 at 5:00 p.m.** to consider available options to the Board of Commissioners regarding a social media post made by Commissioner Spitzer directed at another elected official, and any other matters brought before the Board. The undersigned affirm the intent of the Board of Commissioners to hold a Special Meeting on this matter. This meeting is being held consistent with PA 267 of 1976 (MCL 15.263) to consider the agenda, and for any other matters brought before the committee.

Respectfully submitted,  
Christopher S. Boyd, Chairman  
Jack B. Tany, Vice-Chair  
Dennis M. Harris

Gerald D. Little, Commissioner  
Michael A. Webster, Commissioner

### **Clerk’s Public Notice of Special Board Session**

The Saginaw County Board of Commissioners will convene for a Special Session on  
**Tuesday, December 10, 2024 at 5:00 p.m.**

in the Board Chambers, Second Floor - Room 200, Saginaw County Governmental Center, Saginaw, MI per PA 267 of 1976 to consider available options to the Board of Commissioners regarding a social media post made by Commissioner Spitzer directed at another elected official, and any other matters brought before the Board.

This Special Meeting is being held consistent with Article II, Section 2.8 (MCLA 46.10) of the 2024 Rules of the Saginaw County Board of Commissioners as authorized by petition of at least one third (1/3<sup>rd</sup>) of the members of the Board.

Requests for Public Comment (Audiences) must be made to the Board of Commissioners Office at (989) 790-5267 or by email to boc@saginawcounty.com prior to 12:00 p.m. (noon) the day of the meeting.

If you are disabled and need accommodation to provide you with an opportunity to participate, please call the Board of Commissioners at (989) 790-5267.

Respectfully submitted,

**Vanessa Guerra**  
Vanessa Guerra, County Clerk

November 27, 2024  
Posted 11-27-24 by SEK/RLS/CH

### **PUBLIC HEARING**

None



## AUDIENCES

- Alethea Nichols Taylor spoke of encouraging Amaya Bradley to run for office. She also spoke about defamation and cyber bullying.
- Nicole Lee, resident of Saginaw Township, spoke in defense of Commissioner Spitzer stating that he has done good work as a commissioner and the reaction was disproportionate to the offense. She challenged all commissioners to disclose their own Facebook posts, including those they have deleted. She confronted those who called Commissioner Spitzer a racist, disclosing that his first marriage of 15 years was to a black woman.
- Shalana Bradley, spoke of being proud of her daughter, Trustee Amaya Bradley, the first African-American and youngest Trustee for Saginaw Township. She is not satisfied with Commissioner Spitzer’s “superficial” apology. She spoke of Amaya’s character and that Amaya was helpful during Shalana’s journey through a serious health condition. In reference to Commissioner Spitzer’s actions she asked the board, “Is this the face of your brand?”
- Eric Kowalewski, resident of Freeland, thanked the commissioners for being good stewards of money and for working together to accomplish great things for Saginaw County. He acknowledged that a majority of the board’s decisions are unanimous due to striving for unity, regardless of the party they represent, in order to accomplish great things. He referenced a Bible verse (Matthew 25:40).
- Judi Lincoln, resident of Saginaw Township, commented that Commissioner Spitzer’s apology was a ruse and that he would have had to dig deep to find the other Amaya Bradley. She encouraged the board to censure Commissioner Spitzer and limit his duties.
- Dennis Krajniak stated his first awareness of the incident was from News 5. Commissioner Spitzer took down the Facebook post within 5 minutes and called to apologize. Mr. Krajniak encouraged the commissioners to put the matter to rest, to be united not divided, and to share Jesus’ gift of forgiveness this Christmas. He asked commissioners to be part of a solution, not a problem.
- William A. Crane, Retired Judge and Powerhouse Gym owner from 2003 – 2009, referenced John 8:7 “He that is without sin among you, let him first cast a stone...” He said that for Commissioner Spitzer to judge on race or sex would not be true to his character and that commissioners should consider the “whole” person.
- Terry Pruitt, NAACP President and 45-year resident of Saginaw Township, encouraged the board to accept the Executive Committee’s recommendation to censure Commissioner Spitzer. There should be consequences for mistakes and believes his actions were clearly intended to disparage someone, and that the actions were racist and misogynistic. He requested a statement of apology.
- Janet Deneen is a resident of Saginaw Township (38 years), member of Hopevale Church, volunteer at the underground Railroad, the Partnership Center and the Saginaw Area Fireworks. She stated she has had a 40-year career in business and knows what it feels like to work with people who tried to minimize her due to her position and gender. Without intending to minimize his actions, she advised that Commissioner Spitzer is a man of high integrity and finding the matter of resolve this incident should be between Commissioner Spitzer and Trustee Bradley. Mrs. Deneen urged commissioners to “de-escalate this matter and to focus on the business of managing Saginaw County.” She believes censure is inappropriate.



- Jeffrey Patterson, Saginaw Township resident, stated Commissioner Spitzer’s Facebook post was both racist and misogynistic. Further, his lack of emotional control and inability to separate his personal interest from public interest affects his judgment in carrying out his duties as a county official. Mr. Patterson conveyed that “he displayed recklessness regarding the truth, incompetence in evaluating information, and disrespect towards others, all of which run counter to the expectations of a public official.” He blames this type of conduct for the reason good people are unwilling to take public office due to public abuse they receive in return for their efforts. Mr. Patterson expressed a desire for Commissioner Spitzer to resign.
- Angie Miller, lifelong resident of Saginaw County, thanked commissioners for having a Special Board meeting, and expressed that Commissioner Spitzer is supposed to be a pillar. She is disgusted by his Facebook post and asked him to resign.

## LAUDATORY RESOLUTIONS

None

## INITIATORY MOTIONS

None

## PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

***By the Chair: That the following communications received by the Board of Commissioners are referred as designated, if there are no objections. The Chair hears none; it is so ordered.***

- **PETITION** for Special Board Session on Tuesday, December 10, 2024 at 5:00 p.m.
- **PUBLIC NOTICE** of Special Board Session on Tuesday, December 10, 2024 at 5:00 p.m.

## REPORTS OF COMMITTEES

1. **Executive Committee – C. Boyd, Chair**  
Submission of Resolution of Censure re: Commissioner Richard Spitzer
  - ❖ Vice-Chair Tany read the proposed Resolution of Censure of Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer for Conduct Unbecoming a Public Servant.
  - ❖ Commissioner Spitzer responded, acknowledging this is a terrible thing. He apologized to the full board, Ms. Bradley and the whole community. He admitted that on November 19, 2024 he made a terrible blunder with his thoughtless post and immediately took it down. He said it was careless and rash and that he has read every social media comment, email, news story and responded to every phone call since. He has agonized over his error and lost sleep over it saying he did not, at the time of posting, see the implications of it. He has long worked to foster harmony and has reached out to many community leaders asking how to regain trust. He vowed nothing like this would ever happen again and stated he is committed to doing whatever it takes to regain trust and ensure everyone is valued and respected.



- ❖ Commissioner Coney reflected that, as a Christian, she knows she is called to forgive and she does, but Commissioner Spitzer’s actions were hurtful to Amaya, this board, and county. She believes his actions were intentional because he didn’t post any congratulatory message or photos about other winners. She stressed that some type of censure is needed.
- **Vice-Chair Tany moved, seconded by Commissioner Webster, to adopt the Resolution of Censure of Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer for Conduct Unbecoming a Public Servant. Motion carried by the following roll-call vote:**

**YEAS:** Mark S. Piotrowski, Jack B. Tany, Richard A. Spitzer, Sheldon Matthews, Tracey L. Slodowski, Dennis M. Harris, Dennis H. Krafft, Gerald D. Little, Lisa R. Coney, Michael A. Webster, and Christopher S. Boyd – **11**

**NAYS:** None – 0

**ABSENT:** None – 0

[Resolution begins on next page]



## RESOLUTIONS

### SAGINAW COUNTY RESOLUTION 2024 – 11



### RESOLUTION OF CENSURE of Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer for Conduct Unbecoming a Public Servant

Christopher S. Boyd, Jack B. Tany, Lisa R. Coney, Denny M. Harris, Dennis H. Krafft,  
Gerald D. Little, Sheldon Matthews, Mark S. Piotrowski, Tracey L. Slodowski,  
Richard A. Spitzer, Michael A. Webster

**At a special meeting of the Board of Commissioners of the County of Saginaw, State of Michigan,  
held at Saginaw, Michigan, on the 10<sup>th</sup> day of December 2024.**

PRESENT: Christopher S. Boyd, Jack B. Tany, Lisa R. Coney, Dennis M. Harris, Dennis H. Krafft,  
Gerald D. Little, Sheldon Matthews, Mark S. Piotrowski, Tracey L. Slodowski, Richard A.  
Spitzer, Michael A. Webster

ABSENT: None

The following resolution was offered by Commissioner and Vice-Chair Jack B. Tany and seconded by  
Commissioner Michael A. Webster:

**WHEREAS**, Richard A. Spitzer has been a Commissioner for District 3 of the County of Saginaw since  
January 3, 2023; and

**WHEREAS**, a County Commissioner's duties and responsibilities do not include commenting on matters  
that are not connected to another elected official's ability and qualifications to serve as a Trustee of  
their governmental unit; and

**WHEREAS**, Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer and his wife, Constance Reppuhn, were both up for re-  
election in the November 2024 election, and while Commissioner Spitzer won his re-election, his wife  
was not re-elected; and,

**WHEREAS**, a Saginaw Township Trustee (hereinafter referred to as "Trustee"), who happens to be a  
Black woman, defeated Commissioner Richard Spitzer's wife, and that a recount of that election was  
filed which could affect which of those candidates serves as a Trustee; and,

**WHEREAS**, Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer reposted on Facebook photos of a suggestive nature of a  
person who he falsely represented as the Trustee who won the contested race wherein his wife did  
not; and,

**WHEREAS**, the images reposted by Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer were not, in fact, of the Trustee  
who won the race in which Commissioner Spitzer's wife lost the election; and,



**WHEREAS**, the person whose photos he reposted was not even from the state of Michigan and are clearly of another woman; and,

**WHEREAS**, the intent of the posting was clearly to cause embarrassment, negative reactions and humiliation to the Trustee who won the seat in the election in which his wife lost; and,

**WHEREAS**, the repost caused immediate public outcry and condemnation of Commissioner Spitzer and his actions, and many people cited the short- and long-term harm caused by a person in Commissioner Spitzer’s position to demean and shame a young black woman who was successful in running to represent her community on a governing body; and,

**WHEREAS**, Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer made no other posts regarding any of the other individuals who also were successful in their bids to serve on the same board – but instead singled out the Black female Trustee; and,

**WHEREAS**, the Board of Commissioners conducted an Executive Committee meeting on December 4, 2024 at which time it voted unanimously to recommend to the full Board of Commissioners that Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer receive a Resolution of Censure and be sanctioned by removal from all existing committee assignments; and

**WHEREAS**, the Board of Commissioners hereby finds that Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer has brought dishonor to Saginaw County and the Board of Commissioners by:

- Conduct and behavior unbecoming a public servant; and,
- Failure to treat an individual and others fairly and courteously because of race, gender and other immutable characteristics; and,
- Engaging in actions contrary to the mission statement and values of Saginaw County, thereby exhibiting a lack of kindness and respect for others; and,
- Exhibiting a lack of recognition of the electoral process and disrespect for the will of the voters.

**WHEREAS**, it has been determined that Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer has engaged in inappropriate and unprofessional conduct for which he has failed to offer acknowledgement and apology to this Board and its members; and

**WHEREAS**, the Board of Commissioners seeks to hold its elected officials accountable to the truth and condemns the divisiveness and eroding of the public trust of the Board of Commissioners caused by these actions; and,

**WHEREAS**, Censure is to express severe disapproval of someone or something in a formal statement.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that the Saginaw County Board of Commissioners declares that Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer is censured for his conduct as set forth above; and,

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that the Board of Commissioners hereby determines that Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer be sanctioned by removal from all existing committee assignments; and

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that the Board of Commissioners hereby resolves that Commissioner Richard A. Spitzer be stripped of all voting rights for the remainder of his term of office.







**COMMISSIONER AUDIENCES**

None

**By Commissioner Tany, seconded by Commissioner Harris: That the Board adjourn. Motion Carried.** Thereupon, the Board adjourned at 5:55 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

**SAGINAW COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS**

**CHRISTOPHER S. BOYD**

**CHAIRMAN**

**VANESSA GUERRA**

**COUNTY CLERK**

Prepared by: Suzy Koeplinger, Deputy County Clerk