

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Saginaw County Building Authority**  
**Thursday, December 1, 2022**  
**County of Saginaw Courthouse – Boardroom 200**  
**111 S. Michigan Avenue, Saginaw, MI 48602**

Present: Robert V. Belleman, Tim Novak, Bill Smith, Leon Turnwald  
Absent: Ann-Marie Batkoski  
Others: Carl Ruth, (BOC Chairman), Sheldon Matthews (BOC Vice Chairman) Jake Golden (Spence), Ben LeBlanc (Granger), Cherie Armstrong (Granger), Kelly Studor (Dow Event Center), Tony DePelsmaeker (Maintenance Director), Zack Robinson (MMIA), Kelly Suppes (Purchasing/Risk) Bonnie Kanicki (SCACC Director) Jaime Ceja (Controller's Office)

- I. **CALL TO ORDER:** Chairman Belleman called the meeting to order at 10:30a.m.
- II. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** None
- III. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF NOVEMBER 3, 2022:** Member Novak moved to approve November 3, 2022 meeting minutes, seconded by Member Turnwald. Motion passed.
- IV. **THE DOW EVENT CENTER CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PROJECT: JAKE GOLDEN: SPENCE BROTHERS**

1. **Potential Change Orders:**

- a. **PCO #048– Move money in 10 Codes.** Cost 0.00
- b. **PCO #049 – Pullman Unspent Unit Prices.** \$256,556.08
- c. **PCO #051 – Elevator Window Re Seal.** Cost \$9574.00

Member Turnwald made a motion to approve PCO's #048-#049 and PCO#051. Member Novak supported. The motion passed (4-0).

- d. **PCO #050 – Parking Deck Structural Bulletin.** Communication has been difficult with the vendor. Cost was in the original budget to cut the openings to accommodate the cars, it was removed because it was determined to not be needed. In review with Kone engineers, the openings need to be cut wider and taller, 10"W x 4"H. This applies to both shafts. Cost \$124,676.00

Member Novak made a motion to approve PCO #050. Member Turnwald supported. The motion passed (3-0).

- e. Subcontract **Change Order #003** presented with the below calculations.  
(\$256,556.08) original credit.
- f. **PCO #052 – Pullman CCO #001.** Cost -\$94,935.50
- g. **PCO #053 – Pullman CCO #002.** Cost -\$725.00
- h. **PCO #054 – Curbs and Striping.** Cost \$45,540.00
- i. **PCO #055 – Bulletin #3.** Cost \$226,875.00
- j. **PCO #056 – Additional Coating.** Cost \$12,520.00
- k. **PCO #057 – Railings.** Cost \$6,000.00
- l. **PCO #058 – Line striping work.** Cost \$2500.00

Member Smith made a motion to approve PCO's #052-#058. Member Turnwald supported. The motion passed (4-0).

2. **Project Update -**

- a. **Chiller** – Spence has contractually parted ways with American Arena and are currently looking at other companies to come set up the chiller. Member Smith asked about the warranty and Jake stated that the new company will guarantee running for a minimum of 30 days and then the warranty will start.
- b. **Elevator Schedule** – Confirmation that the NE elevator will be on site in January and the SW in mid-February. Demolition work on both elevators and concrete in the pits is complete. J. Ranke is working on power. Pumford has all scaffolding and the hoist in place and 5 and 6<sup>th</sup> floors cut. Elevator shafts will be done by Christmas and then Kone can install the cars. Additional staffing by the 1<sup>st</sup> of the year may not be necessary as we will be waiting on Kone to install the cars. Project will be done by Mid February/March.
- c. **Pullman Credit** – PCO #049-CCO #003 are Pullmans’ credit. Just shy of \$60,000.00 minus \$21,000.00 for the roof equals a net of \$40,000.00 back to the Building Authority.
- d. **Consumers Rebate** – Check handed to Chairman Belleman for \$36,903.00.
- e. **Deck Painting Cost** – 2 Contractors bid the job. First bid was to paint all 4 stair towers, walls, floors, door frames and the second was to paint only what was painted before. Jake also recommended a lead test, there were 5 coats of paint in the stairwells. There is \$140,000.00 in contingency unspent at this time, but in Jake’s opinion there are better spends for this money. Painting couldn’t happen until the summer and Jake would recommend that they get further along in the elevator project first.
  - 1. **Murray** –
    - a. Inside of stairwells - \$107,492.00
    - b. Outside stair towers, beams, yellow knee walls - \$214,935.00
  - 2. **NCS** –
    - a. Stairwells - \$120,492.00
    - b. Parking Ramp - \$213,508.00
- 3. **Stair Towers Egress Cost** – There is an issue with the egress door locks not being able to disengage from inside the stairwell. Kelly Studor was almost locked in. The doors can only unlock from the outside/deck area. Proposal from Architectural Glazing presented. Cost - \$3382.00

V. **Roof Leaks** – There have been no leaks since the last meeting, they seem to happen when the winds pick up. It is believed that the leaks are from the joints. The cost to re-caulk is \$90K-100K. Exterior masonry control joints were not part of the original scope of work. Chairman Belleman asked if something was missed that should have been in the original bid. Jake stated that it is not uncommon to have leaks from a newly installed roof, and if you remove the tiles, you can see it coming down the steel and going to the roof. Chairman Belleman stated that he wants an explanation from Spence as to how this was missed and not included in the original bid. This was awarded as a design build project and Jake is unsure who did the original scope of work. Chairman Belleman asked if when you look at the scope of work do you not look at anything else, the surrounding and supporting areas? Jake stated that when the roof went on, there were several areas that were leaking that are no longer leaking. Member Smith asked if Jake would recommend caulking the entire roof

or just the leaking areas, is the masonry work cracked? Jake stated no. Member Smith asked if there had been any inspection of the joints in the masonry? Is this just the control joint caulk failing? Chairman Belleman asked if we approve the caulking of the control joints, and the leak still exists, how do you justify the \$100,000 spend? Member Smith asked to engage an independent contractor to look at the leaks and report back on their findings. Jake agreed. Jake stated that Brian Keeler was responsible for the work done with Kibbe. Chairman asked for Spence CFO Norm Thomas, Shane, Ed, and Brian attend the next meeting to discuss the Chiller and the roof leaks.

**VI. SCACC RESOURCE CENTER: BEN LEBLANC AND CHERIE ARMSTRONG: GRANGER**

**1. Potential Change Orders:**

- a. **PCO #028– Water Room Heater** – Cost to add a controllable electric heater. Chairman Belleman asked why the water heater was designed in an unheated room? Ben stated that it was discussed with Kibbe and they admitted they “missed it”. Chairman Belleman asked whether the entire room should be heated. Ben stated that the water heater is gas and will produce its own heat. Member Turnwald asked why the heater has its own room? Ben stated that it was a Kibbe design. Member Smith stated that the Building Authority should recoup costs from Kibbe in relation to this design flaw. Cost is \$2,155.81

Member Smith made a motion to approve PCO #028 based on discussion with Kibbe for credit. Member Novak supported. The motion passed (4-0).

2. **Roof Hydrant Drains** – This is complete. Chairman Belleman pointed out these were not on the plans either.
3. **Schedule** – The main building siding will be complete next week; the pole barn will be done in a few weeks. Fencing is complete at the dog runs and gates will be coming in 2 weeks. Duct work, insulation is complete. Asphalt is done, Block fill and painting is complete. Finishing paint and epoxy floor in the dog runs is being started next week Monday and will take two weeks to complete. Chairman Belleman asked if the flooring was MDARD approved. Ben stated Blue Sky chose the flooring, but he will double check before starting. Equipment is scheduled for delivery on the 19<sup>th</sup>. Consumer’s is on site now installing utilities. Canopies will go in next week. Chairman Belleman asked if the canopies were fabric or metal. Ben stated steel. Brick pedestals and fence corners are complete, and project is on schedule for roof top units.
4. **Garage Insulation** – Complete.
5. **Back-up Generator** – This is still 1 year out.
6. **Security Update** – Tony DePelsMaeker – 95% of the cabling is complete for readers, and cameras. He has a question for Kochville Township regarding lock boxes and whether we need one. He has reached out to the Fire Marshall to find out.
7. **Lighting Controls** – The electrical engineer and electrician are working on the lighting system. There are not enough connections, so when a switch is activated, it is affecting other areas of the shelter. Ben stated that it was designed inadequately, and that Kibbe used a 3<sup>rd</sup> party to design it. \$11,000 was the original price. Chairman Belleman asked if the sub-contractors had to submit a design plan. Ben stated that yes, they would have to on a lighting plan.
8. **Other** – Chairman Belleman asked that Ben submit to him a list of design flaws by the end of next week. The Building Authority chose Granger based on experience in building similar structures, specifically Lansing. Are these oversights the responsibility of Kibbe or

Granger? Ben stated that Lansing never had a generator but did purchase one after the fact. Chairman Belleman asked if Lansing determined they needed it after the build and Granger knew that, seeing that Saginaw did not have one in the design plans, why would Granger not bring that up and allow the Building Authority to decide whether it would absorb the additional cost? Ben stated that he would put together a list of design flaws.

9. **Medical Equipment** – Member Smith inquired about the Medical Equipment and where the project was at. Chairman Belleman stated there was a bid by Ecker but the equipment was too big and noisy so the County now has to supply portable equipment. It has been frustrating getting an answer from Kibbe and Granger on exactly what the County has to provide. Ben stated we would need piping for the Anesthetic and Medical suction. Chairman Belleman asked if we needed piping with portables. Ben stated yes. Member Smith asked if anything was installed that should not have been and did we pay monies for equipment we cannot use.
10. **Contingency** – Under \$3,000 and with the approved PCO today it will be under \$1,000.
11. **Bonnie Kanicki** – Was presented with the Shelter of the year award from MAACO.
12. **Signage** – Chairman Ruth asked if the current sign will be moved to the new shelter. Cherie stated it would be and that she believes the placement will be on the corner of Bay Rd.

**VII. DOW EVENT CENTER – KELLY STUDOR – FINANCE DIRECTOR**

1. **Other -**

- a. **General Update** – Everything is functioning well. Saginaw Spirit put in a bid for the Memorial Cup in 2024. This will require the Dow to make some investments in the suites and locker rooms. Chairman Belleman asked Kelly to start putting together a list of what will need to be completed and have it ready for the new GM who starts on Jan 2, 2023.
- b. **Roof Leaks** - Kelly agreed with Jake's perspective about the roof leaks, and we need to know where they are coming from before we do anything. Member Turnwald asked Jake for pictures, he stated that leaks are not unusual but you have to know where they are coming from to fix them.
- c. **General Manager Update** – Steve St. John will start on January, 2023. He comes with a lot of operations experience.
- d. **Parking Garage Security** – Chairman Belleman asked if we have security in the parking garage. Kelly stated no, there are operations employees who will walk through and check it on occasion.
- e. **Parking Arms** – Kelly stated these are still not operable on their own and there are staff manning them at events. The issue is internet and the Point of Sale (POS) system only functions with internet. Monthly parkers can still use the system. Spectrum was working on the project and had approvals, was emailing that they were working on it and then suddenly stopped. They stated that they could not justify the costs associated with pavement work that the City of Saginaw has asked them to perform. Chairman Belleman asked if wireless was an option. Kelly stated, she was told no because of the structure. Chairman Belleman asked for contact information so Tony could reach out to Spectrum contacts.

**VIII. NEXT MEETING** – January 5, 2023 at 10:30 a.m.

**IX. ADJOURNMENT:** Member Novak moved to adjourn the meeting; supported by Member Smith. The meeting was adjourned at 12:12 p.m.